

Title IX Training



**DORAL
ACADEMY**

K-8 Charter School



Schulman,
Lopez, Hoffer
& Adelstein, LLP

Attorneys & Counselors at Law

Part 1: Title IX and the Final Rule

Title IX of the Education Amendments of 1972

- ▶ Prohibits sex discrimination in any education program or activity receiving federal financial assistance.
 - ▶ “No person in the United States, shall, on the basis of sex, be excluded from participation in, be denied the benefits of, or be subjected to discrimination under any education program or activity receiving Federal financial assistance . . .”
- ▶ Conduct that is so severe, pervasive, and objectively offensive that it denies victims equal access to a school program or activity.

Title IX, Cont.

- ▶ Sex discrimination under Title IX can take many forms:
 - ▶ Denying a person admission to the school based on sex.
 - ▶ Declining to hire someone or firing someone because of their sex.
 - ▶ Providing “better” educational resources to male students than to female students.
 - ▶ Unwelcome sexual comments, advances, name calling, etc.

Title IX Regulations (“Final Rule”)

- ▶ Regulations adopted by the United States Department of Education
 - ▶ Defines sexual harassment under Title IX and confirms that sexual harassment (including sexual assault) is a form of unlawful sex discrimination;
 - ▶ Holds schools accountable for failing to respond equitably and promptly to sexual misconduct incidents; and
 - ▶ Requires a reliable adjudication process that is fair to all parties involved.

Sexual Harassment Defined

Conduct based on sex that satisfies one or more of the following:

- ▶ A school employee conditions the provision of an aid, benefit, or service of the school on an individual's participation in unwelcome sexual conduct (quid pro quo harassment);
- ▶ Unwelcome conduct determined by a reasonable person to be so severe, pervasive, and objectively offensive that it effectively denies a person equal access to the school's education program or activity (hostile environment harassment); or
- ▶ Sexual assault, dating violence, domestic violence, or stalking as those terms are defined in various federal laws (the Clery Act and Violence Against Women Act) .
 - ▶ Final Rule applies to sexual harassment against a person within the United States.

Sexual Orientation, Gender Identity, and Title IX

June 2021 – Office for Civil Rights issued a Notice of Interpretation explaining that it will interpret Title IX’s prohibition on sex discrimination to include:

1. Discrimination based on sexual orientation, and
2. Discrimination based on gender identity.

Title IX Jurisdiction

- ▶ K-12 schools have jurisdiction under Title IX when the reported sexual harassment occurs in the school's education program or activity.
 - ▶ Includes locations, events, or circumstances over which the school exercised substantial control over both the respondent and the context in which the sexual harassment occurred.

Jurisdiction, cont.

- ▶ Title IX applies to all of Doral's education programs or activities, whether they occur on-campus or off-campus.
 - ▶ Extracurricular activities, field trips, study abroad programs, regular instructional activities, etc.
 - ▶ ***But*** a person must be participating in an education program or activity located ***within the United States*** to be covered under Title IX.
- ▶ If harassing conduct does not meet Title IX's definition of sexual harassment or is not related to an education program or activity in the United States, the Title IX complaint process does not apply.
 - ▶ However, the school should still address the conduct under a non-Title IX policy (general non-discrimination and harassment, David's Law, etc.).

Key Title IX Terms

- ▶ Complainant – Individual alleged to be the victim of conduct that could constitute sexual harassment.
- ▶ Respondent – Individual who has been reported to be the perpetrator of conduct that could constitute sexual harassment.

General Procedural Requirements

The Final Rule requires that all K-12 recipients of federal funds:

- ▶ Treat complainants and respondents equitably.
- ▶ Presume that a respondent is not responsible for the alleged harassment until a determination regarding responsibility is made.
- ▶ Evaluate all relevant evidence objectively.
- ▶ Ensure that Title IX stakeholders are impartial and free from a conflict of interest or bias and receive required trainings.

General Procedural Requirements

- ▶ Conduct a grievance process in a “reasonably prompt” timeframe.
- ▶ Notify the parties of the range of potential disciplinary sanctions, supportive measures, and possible remedies if a respondent is found responsible.
- ▶ Identify a standard of evidence to be used for all formal complaints of sexual harassment.
 - ▶ Options are the “preponderance of the evidence” or “clear and convincing evidence” standards.

General Procedural Requirements

- ▶ Develop procedures for appeals.
- ▶ Recognize evidence protected under a recognized legal privilege (attorney-client privilege, medical privilege, etc.), unless a party waives the privilege.

Part 2: Title IX Stakeholders

Title IX Stakeholders

- ▶ Title IX Coordinator(s) – Doral must designate at least one Title IX Coordinator, who is responsible for overseeing the school's efforts to comply with Title IX.
 - ▶ Also handles initial communications with parties involved in a Title IX proceeding.

Notice of Title IX Coordinator

- ▶ Contact information for the Title IX Coordinator(s) must be provided to:
 - ▶ Applicants for admission and employment;
 - ▶ Employees;
 - ▶ Parents and legal guardians of elementary and secondary students; and
 - ▶ Unions or other collective bargaining entities who have a relationship with the school (not likely to come up in Texas schools).

Notice of Title IX Coordinator

- ▶ Information to provide:
 - ▶ Name or title
 - ▶ Office address
 - ▶ E-mail address
 - ▶ Telephone number
- ▶ Information must be disseminated in the employee and student handbooks, and available on Doral's website.

Title IX Stakeholders

- ▶ Investigator(s) – designated to investigate formal complaints of sexual harassment and prepare an investigative report.
- ▶ Decision-maker(s) – review investigative reports and issue determination on responsibility.
 - ▶ CANNOT be the Title IX Coordinator or investigator who conducted the investigation.
- ▶ Appeal Officer – reviews appeals of a determination on responsibility.
 - ▶ CANNOT be the Title IX Coordinator, investigator, or decision-maker with prior involvement in the complaint.

Part 3: Serving Impartially and Avoiding Prejudgment, Conflicts of Interest, and Bias

Importance of Impartiality

- ▶ Impartiality is a key component of the Title IX process.
- ▶ Title IX Stakeholders must avoid:
 - ▶ Prejudging the facts at issue;
 - ▶ Conflicts of interest; and
 - ▶ Bias.

Prejudgment of Facts at Issue

- ▶ Prejudgment means passing judgment prematurely or without conducting a sufficient investigation or review of evidence.
- ▶ Examples:
 - ▶ A complainant cries during an interview; the investigator believes the complainant is telling the truth because there's no reason to cry if you're being untruthful.
 - ▶ Assuming there was consensual conduct simply because a complainant and respondent were in a dating relationship.
 - ▶ Assuming a complainant's statements are false because, during an interview, the complainant acknowledged smoking marijuana prior an incident referenced in a formal complaint.

Avoiding Prejudgment

- ▶ Avoid misconceptions and stereotypes about sexual harassment, such as:
 - ▶ Only a woman can be sexually harassed.
 - ▶ Sexual harassment can only occur between a man and a woman.
 - ▶ If there's no physical contact, there's no sexual harassment.
 - ▶ It only happened once, so it can't be harassment.
 - ▶ She was “asking for it” by wearing those clothes.

Avoiding Prejudgment

- ▶ Keep an open mind.
- ▶ Gather the facts before reaching a conclusion.
 - ▶ Get information from multiple sources / witnesses.

Conflicts of Interest

- ▶ Be aware of actual, perceived, or potential conflicts of interest.
 - ▶ Is there a family, social, professional, or other interest that could compromise your judgment, decisions, or steps taken during a Title IX investigation?

Conflicts of Interest

- ▶ Actual Conflict – Direct conflict between official duties and responsibilities, or a competing personal interest.
 - ▶ Investigator’s daughter is the complainant in a formal complaint.
 - ▶ Decision-maker’s son is named as respondent in a formal complaint.

Conflicts of Interest

- ▶ Perceived Conflict – Someone involved in the process could reasonably perceive that a competing interest may improperly influence conduct during investigation.
 - ▶ Respondent plays on a youth soccer team, and the investigator coaches the team.
 - ▶ Decision-maker has been close family friends with the complainant's parents for many years.
 - ▶ Investigator's wife teaches piano lessons to the respondent.

Conflicts of Interest

- ▶ Potential Conflict – Personal obligation or interest may conflict with duties and responsibilities in the future.
 - ▶ Decision-maker supervises a group of teachers...potential conflict if one of those teachers is named as a respondent in a formal complaint?

Recognizing Conflicts of Interest

- ▶ Can I impartially participate in this complaint and the investigation process?
 - ▶ What would others think if they learned of the conflict?
 - ▶ Would the respondent or complainant have reasonable concerns that I could not conduct myself impartially?
 - ▶ If someone else had the same potential conflict, would I feel that they should not participate in the investigation process?

Recognizing Bias

- ▶ Bias is an inclination, tendency, or possible prejudice toward / against someone.
- ▶ Stereotypes based on gender, sexual orientation, race, etc.
- ▶ Examples:
 - ▶ Decision-maker finds a respondent is more credible than the complainant because the respondent is a native English speaker, while the complainant is a native Korean speaker and does not speak “perfect” English.
 - ▶ Investigator ends every interview with “Boys will be boys, right?”

Recognizing Bias

- ▶ Important to guard against bias in the Title IX context.
 - ▶ Most evidence will be circumstantial.
 - ▶ Possible biases based on race, economic standing, academic history, social standing of complainant or respondent.
 - ▶ “Nerd” versus “jock,” head cheerleader, star basketball player, in the running for valedictorian, department chair, etc.

Avoiding Bias

- ▶ Watch your language.
- ▶ Listen to what people are saying, stick with the facts, and avoid generalizations.
- ▶ **TREAT COMPLAINANTS AND RESPONDENTS EQUALLY, REGARDLESS OF DEMOGRAPHICS OR OTHER FACTORS.**

Part 4: Responding to Reports of Sexual Harassment

Types of Reports

- ▶ The Final Rule recognizes two general types of reports – informal and formal complaints.
 - ▶ Nature of the report will determine Doral's process for responding.
- ▶ The Final Rule requires a K-12 school to respond whenever there is “actual knowledge” of possible sexual harassment.
 - ▶ Actual knowledge threshold is met when a report of potential sexual harassment is provided to a Title IX Coordinator, a school official with authority to institute corrective measures, or any employee of an elementary or secondary school. If a school employee personally observes sexual harassment, the school must respond and address the sexual harassment as required under the Final Rule.
- ▶ Must respond in a manner that is not deliberately indifferent (response must be reasonable in light of the known circumstances).

Informal Complaints

- ▶ Any person may report sex discrimination, including sexual harassment, regardless of whether the person making the report is the complainant.
- ▶ Reports may be made:
 - ▶ In person
 - ▶ By mail
 - ▶ By telephone
 - ▶ By e-mail
 - ▶ Any other means that result in the Title IX Coordinator receiving the person's written or verbal report
 - ▶ At any time, including non-business hours, by using the telephone number or e-mail address, or by mail to the office address, listed for a Title IX Coordinator.

Initial Assessment of Report

- ▶ After receiving notice of a report of potential sex-based harassment, the Title IX Coordinator must perform an initial assessment.
 - ▶ Determine whether the alleged conduct constitutes sexual harassment under the Final Rule.
 - ▶ Does the conduct meet the definition of sexual harassment?
 - ▶ Did the conduct occur in Doral's education program or activities?
 - ▶ Did the conduct occur against a person in the United States?

Initial Assessment

- ▶ If the conduct described in the report (i) does not meet the definition of sexual harassment in the Final Rule, (ii) did not occur in Doral's education program or activities, or (iii) the conduct occurred outside the United States, Doral is not required to go through the “formal complaint” process outlined in the Final Rule.
- ▶ However, Doral should still address such conduct in a report in a manner consistent with other applicable non-discrimination / harassment policies.

Response by Title IX Coordinator

- ▶ If Doral receives notice of an allegation that, if proved, would meet the Final Rule's definition of sexual harassment, the Title IX Coordinator must promptly and confidentially contact the complainant to:
 - ▶ Discuss the availability of supportive measures;
 - ▶ Consider the complainant's wishes with respect to supportive measures;
 - ▶ Inform the complainant of the availability of supportive measures with or without the filing of a formal complaint; and
 - ▶ Explain to the complainant the process for filing a formal complaint.
- ▶ Complainant's wishes should be respected, unless the Title IX Coordinator determines signing a formal complaint to initiate the formal grievance process is not clearly unreasonable in light of the known circumstances.

Response by Title IX Coordinator

- ▶ Doral must treat complainants and respondents equally by:
 - ▶ As appropriate, offering supportive measures to both parties; and
 - ▶ Complying with Doral's formal Title IX grievance process before taking disciplinary action.

What Are Supportive Measures?

- ▶ Individualized services reasonably available that are non-punitive, non-disciplinary, and not unreasonably burdensome to the other party, and further designed to ensure equal education access, protect safety, or deter sexual harassment.
 - ▶ Counseling
 - ▶ Extensions of deadlines or other course-related adjustments
 - ▶ Modifications of work or class schedules
 - ▶ Campus escort services
 - ▶ Mutual restrictions on contact between the parties
 - ▶ Leaves of absence
 - ▶ Increased security
 - ▶ Other similar measures

Supportive Measures

- ▶ No fees may be charged to complainant or respondent.
- ▶ Supportive measures may be offered before or after a formal complaint is filed.
- ▶ Supportive measures are generally confidential (need-to-know basis only).
- ▶ Title IX Coordinator responsible for coordinating the effective implementation of supportive measures.
 - ▶ e.g., informing teacher why a student is missing class, obtaining make-up work from teachers, re-arranging student or employee schedule.

Formal Complaint Grievance Process

- ▶ Formal Complaint – document filed by a complainant (or signed by the Title IX Coordinator) alleging sexual harassment against a respondent and requesting that Doral investigate.
 - ▶ At the time of filing a formal complaint, a complainant must be participating in or attempting to participate in Doral's education programs or activities.
 - ▶ Formal complaint may be filed with the Title IX Coordinator in person, by mail, or by-email, or any additional method designated by Doral.

Formal Complaints

- ▶ What if the complainant or respondent is a minor?
 - ▶ Final Rule expressly recognizes the legal rights of parents and guardians to act on behalf of a party, including by filing a formal complaint.
 - ▶ Parent or guardian does not become a “complainant” (or a “respondent”), but they can act on behalf of their child during the formal complaint process.

Formal Complaints

- ▶ Title IX Coordinator may file a formal complaint.
 - ▶ Multiple reports against the same respondent.
 - ▶ Health or safety issue.
 - ▶ Example: Lydia talks to the Title IX Coordinator and reports that her lab partner, Claire, may be a victim of dating violence. Lydia has seen bruises on Claire's arms and has heard Claire's boyfriend yelling at Claire at school and pushing her in the hallway. Lydia asks if she can file a formal complaint; the Title IX Coordinator responds "no" because Lydia would not be a complainant (Lydia is not the potential victim). However, Lydia may file an informal complaint, and the Title IX Coordinator may decide to initiate a formal complaint for health and safety reasons (dating violence observed on campus).
- ▶ Title IX Coordinator is not considered a complainant by signing a formal complaint.

Formal Complaint: Mandatory Dismissal

Doral must dismiss allegations of conduct that:

- ▶ Does not meet the Final Rule's definition of "sexual harassment";
- ▶ Did not occur in Doral's education program or activity; or
- ▶ Did not occur against a person in the United States.
 - ▶ Notice of dismissal (for Title IX purposes) must be sent to complainant and respondent.

Doral should still address the conduct under other policies.

Formal Complaint: Discretionary Dismissal

Doral may dismiss, at its discretion, a formal complaint or allegations if:

- ▶ A complainant informs the Title IX Coordinator in writing that the complainant wants to withdraw the formal complaint or allegations therein;
- ▶ The respondent is no longer enrolled with or employed by Doral; or
- ▶ Specific circumstances prevent Doral from gathering sufficient evidence to reach a determination.

Notice of dismissal must be sent to complainant and respondent.

The dismissal is for Title IX purposes only; Doral should address the conduct in other appropriate ways.

Appealing Dismissals

- ▶ The complainant and respondent must each be notified in writing of their right to appeal dismissal of a formal complaint.

Formal Complaint - Notice of Allegations

If a formal complaint is not dismissed, the Title IX Coordinator must provide written notice to the parties of:

- ▶ Doral's Title IX formal complaint process, including potential informal resolution process.
- ▶ The allegations, including sufficient details known at the time to allow for sufficient time for a response.
 - ▶ Identities of the parties involved in the incident, if known;
 - ▶ Conduct allegedly constituting sexual harassment; and
 - ▶ Date and location of the alleged incident, if known.

Notice of Allegations

- ▶ Statement that the respondent is presumed not responsible, and that a determination regarding responsibility will be made at the conclusion of the formal complaint process.
- ▶ Inform parties that they may have an advisor of their choice (may or may not be an attorney), and that they may inspect and review evidence.
- ▶ Inform parties of any policies that prohibit knowingly making false statements or knowingly submitting false information during the formal complaint process.

Emergency Removal

- ▶ Doral may temporarily remove a respondent from an education program or activity if:
 - ▶ Individualized safety and risk analysis conducted;
 - ▶ Determination of an immediate threat to the physical health or safety of any student or other individual arising from the allegations of sexual harassment; and
 - ▶ Respondent provided with notice and an opportunity to challenge the decision.

Emergency Removal

- ▶ Notice to respondent:
 - ▶ Written notice not required, but highly recommended.
 - ▶ Describe reasons for finding immediate threat.
 - ▶ Challenge must be filed without delay / as soon as possible after notice of removal is provided.
- ▶ Administrative leave for employees remains available.

Part 5: Informal Resolution Process

Informal Resolution

- ▶ Doral has discretion to offer and facilitate an informal resolution process.
 - ▶ Mediation, restorative justice, etc.
- ▶ Give parties option to try informal resolution rather than go through full formal complaint process.
- ▶ The Title IX Final Rule does not require schools to offer informal resolution.

Informal Resolution

- ▶ Informal resolution may only be offered when a formal complaint of sexual harassment has been filed.
- ▶ The school CANNOT offer informal resolution to resolve allegations that an employee has sexually harassed a student.
- ▶ Both parties must provide informed, written, and voluntary consent to try informal resolution of a formal complaint.

Informal Resolution

- ▶ In order to obtain informed consent for informal resolution, Doral must provide both parties with written notice of:
 - ▶ The allegations made in the formal complaint.
 - ▶ The requirements of the informal resolution process, including situations under which it precludes the parties from resuming a formal complaint arising from the same allegations.
 - ▶ Caveat that, at any time prior to agreeing to a resolution, any party has the right to withdraw from the informal resolution process and resume the grievance process.
 - ▶ Consequences resulting from participating in the informal resolution process, including the records that will be maintained or could be shared.

Informal Resolution

- ▶ Either party can withdraw consent for participating in involuntary resolution at any time before process is completed.
- ▶ Doral cannot require the parties to participate in informal resolution.
 - ▶ Cannot require informal resolution as a condition of enrollment or continuing enrollment, employment or continuing employment, enjoyment of any other right, or waiver of the right to an investigation and adjudication of formal complaints.

Informal Resolution

- ▶ The person facilitating the informal resolution:
 - ▶ Cannot hold another role in the Title IX process (cannot be a Title IX Coordinator, or an investigator, decision-maker, appeal officer, etc. serving in the complaint at issue).
 - ▶ Must be trained on:
 - ▶ The definition of sexual harassment under Title IX;
 - ▶ The scope of the school's education program or activity;
 - ▶ How to conduct an investigation and Doral's grievance process, including hearing (if applicable), appeals, and the informal resolution process; and
 - ▶ How to serve impartially, including avoiding prejudgment of the facts at issue, conflicts of interest, and bias.

Part 6: Investigating Formal Complaints

Formal Complaint Process

Doral's formal complaint grievance process consists of the following:

- ▶ Complainants and respondents are treated equitably.
 - ▶ Remedies provided any time a respondent is found responsible.
 - ▶ Do not impose disciplinary consequences prior to completing the grievance process.
 - ▶ However, emergency removals are allowed in certain circumstances.
- ▶ Remedies designed to maintain a complainant's equal access to Doral's educational programs and activities.

Formal Complaint Process

- ▶ Objective evaluation of all relevant evidence (exculpatory and inculpatory).
- ▶ Avoid creditability determinations based on a person's status as a complainant, respondent, or witness.
- ▶ Title IX personnel stakeholders are free from conflicts of interest or bias for or against complainants or respondents.
- ▶ Presumption that a respondent is not responsible until a determination is made at the conclusion of the grievance process.

Formal Complaint Process

- ▶ Reasonable timeline for concluding the formal complaint process, including appeals and informal resolutions.
 - ▶ Goal is to resolve a grievance / formal complaint as quickly as possible to ensure fairness and accuracy.
 - ▶ Short-term delays and extensions for good cause.
 - ▶ Absence of a party, a party's advisor, or a witness.
 - ▶ Concurrent law enforcement activity.
 - ▶ Need for language assistance or accommodation of disabilities.

Formal Complaint Process

- ▶ Description of range of possible remedies if a respondent is determined to be responsible.
- ▶ Consistent use of evidentiary standard (preponderance or clear and convincing) in all investigations.
 - ▶ Regardless of whether the respondent is a student or Doral employee.
- ▶ Description of appeal procedures.
- ▶ Description of possible supportive measures.

Live Hearings?

- ▶ The Final Rule requires postsecondary institutions to provide a “live hearing with cross-examination” as part of the investigation process.
- ▶ The Final Rule provides that live hearings are optional for K-12 schools.

Investigation Process

- ▶ Doral must investigate the allegations of any formal complaint (unless complaint has been dismissed / withdrawn).
- ▶ As noted earlier, the Title IX Coordinator must send formal notice to the complainant and respondent concerning the details of a formal complaint.

Investigation Process

- ▶ Burden of gathering evidence and burden of “proof” remains on Doral, not the parties.
- ▶ Both parties must have equal opportunity to present facts and witnesses (including experts), as well as other exculpatory or inculpatory evidence.
- ▶ Doral cannot restrict the ability of the parties to discuss the allegations or gather evidence (no “gag orders”).
- ▶ Parties must have the same opportunity to select an advisor (can be, but is not required to be, an attorney).
- ▶ Provide appropriate written notice to the parties of investigative meetings, with sufficient time for the parties to prepare.

Investigation Process

- ▶ Investigators must:
 - ▶ Be impartial throughout the investigation process (free from prejudice of the facts, conflicts of interest, and bias).
 - ▶ Be familiar with school policies related to non-discrimination in general, as well as Title IX requirements.
 - ▶ Not issue “gag orders” that improperly restrict a party’s ability to discuss the issues being investigated.
 - ▶ Allow both parties equal chance to review relevant evidence related to a formal complaint’s allegations.

Why Do Investigations Matter?

- ▶ Compliance with Title IX's requirements.
- ▶ Legal exposure.
 - ▶ Potential liability if Doral knows or should have known about possible sexual harassment and does nothing about it.
 - ▶ If employees have notice of possible sexual harassment, must follow the Title IX process (informal or formal complaint process).
 - ▶ Possible loss of federal funds if Doral fails to comply with Title IX's requirements.

Starting an Investigation

- ▶ Investigator will be assigned by Title IX Coordinator.
- ▶ If you are in the pool of investigators and are approached with an allegation of possible sexual harassment, be sure the Title IX Coordinator is informed.

Starting an Investigation

- ▶ Investigator should review Doral's Title IX policy and formal complaint process, noting the applicable timeline for completing an investigation.
- ▶ Review allegations in the formal complaint to determine scope of investigation.
 - ▶ Identify the parties.
 - ▶ Identify policies related to the complaint.

Starting an Investigation

- ▶ Begin identifying evidence to gather.
 - ▶ Written statements?
 - ▶ Video or audio recording?
 - ▶ Documentary evidence (letters, emails, pictures, or texts provided by the parties)?
- ▶ Begin preparing investigation plan (evidence list, witness list, interview order, etc.).

Starting an Investigation

- ▶ DO NOT promise that disciplinary consequences will be issued against a respondent.
- ▶ DO NOT promise to keep the complainant's identity confidential.
- ▶ Recall that your role is to investigate, not to decide whether sexual harassment occurred.

Begin Collecting Evidence

- ▶ Collect and preserve:
 - ▶ Electronic communications
 - ▶ Security information (hallway cameras?)
 - ▶ Pictures, videos, audio
 - ▶ Personnel files
 - ▶ Student discipline records
 - ▶ Prior complaints
- ▶ Special considerations if a complainant also refers the matter to law enforcement; be careful not to interfere with law enforcement investigations.

What is “Evidence?”

- ▶ Facts available to the investigator.
 - ▶ Information from complainants, respondents, and witnesses.
 - ▶ Information from school records / files.

Commentary to Final Rule

- ▶ Title IX grievance process is not a court proceeding.
- ▶ Comprehensive rules of evidence do not apply.
- ▶ Goal of Final Rule is to “achieve a fair, reliable outcome in the context of sexual harassment” in an education program or activity.
 - ▶ Investigators and other Title IX stakeholders not expected to apply comprehensive, complicated rules of evidence.

Types of Evidence

- ▶ Physical Evidence: Tangible article, object, or similar item that is relevant to the investigation.
 - ▶ Weapon used in an assault.
 - ▶ Marks on clothing.
- ▶ Verbal Evidence: Oral report from a witness or party to the incident.

Types of Evidence

- ▶ Demonstrative Evidence: Something that preserves physical evidence.
 - ▶ Pictures of a physical injury.
 - ▶ Security footage.
- ▶ Documentary Evidence: written evidence (paper or electronic).
 - ▶ Emails.
 - ▶ Text messages or social media postings.
 - ▶ Attendance records (was the respondent at school or a school activity on the date in question?).
 - ▶ Medical records.

Types of Evidence

- ▶ Direct: No need to draw a conclusion to show something happened.
 - ▶ *I was in the restroom and saw Joseph touching Linda's chest while trying to kiss her. I heard Linda telling him to 'stop,' but he kept touching her and trying to kiss her.*
 - ▶ Witness provides direct evidence of what was seen.

Types of Evidence

- ▶ Circumstantial: Need to draw a conclusion or inference to show something happened.
 - ▶ *I was in the hallway and saw Joseph follow Linda into an empty room. Two minutes later, I saw Linda run out of the room with her shirt bunched up and she was crying. Joseph came out a few seconds later and kept his head down as he walked down the hallway.*
 - ▶ Witness did not see or hear what happened in the empty room. Would have to infer what may have happened in the room.
 - ▶ Only reasonable inferences are appropriate.

Types of Evidence

- ▶ Inculpatory evidence: Evidence that shows, or tends to show, a person's involvement in an act.
 - ▶ Example: security footage showing a respondent physically assaulting the complainant.
- ▶ Exculpatory evidence: Evidence that tends to excuse or justify an accused person's actions, or to show a person did not engage in the alleged behavior.
 - ▶ Example: Respondent provides travel records proving she was out of town on the date of an alleged assault, and therefore could not have committed the act in question.

Relevance

- ▶ Only relevant evidence should be considered when preparing an investigative report or determination regarding responsibility.
- ▶ Facts that could potentially explain or describe the incident under investigation.

Determining Relevance

- 1) Review the evidence.
- 2) Review allegations in the formal complaint.
- 3) Does this evidence have the potential to prove or disprove an allegation in the formal complaint?
- 4) Is the Title IX rape shield protection implicated by this evidence, or is there an exception to the rape shield protection?

“Rape Shield Protections”

- ▶ The Final Rule provides that questions / evidence about a complainant’s prior sexual history / behavior is not relevant, unless it is offered:
 - ▶ To prove that someone other than the respondent committed the conduct alleged by the complainant, or
 - ▶ To provide details concerning the complainant’s prior sexual behavior with the respondent to prove consent.

Privileged Records

- ▶ Final Rule recognizes protections for certain privileged records.
 - ▶ Medical / treatment records.
 - ▶ Attorney-client communications.
 - ▶ Implicating yourself in a crime (5th Amendment)
 - ▶ Confessions to clergy members or other religious figures.
 - ▶ Spousal testimony in criminal matters.
- ▶ Investigator must not use, rely on, or seek disclosure of information protected under a legally recognized privilege, unless the person holding the privilege has waived it.

Investigation Process

- ▶ Provide notice to the parties of meetings or interviews involving the other party.
 - ▶ If a party's attendance / participation is necessary, give written notice of the date, time, and location along with summary of who you anticipate being in attendance and basic summary of the meeting's purpose.
 - ▶ Attempt multiple interviews if a witness does not show for an interview.
- ▶ Interview all relevant (and available) witnesses.
 - ▶ Potential for follow-up interviews as investigation progresses.

Investigation Process

- ▶ Doral carries burden of gathering evidence and burden of proof.
- ▶ Parties must have equal opportunity to present facts and expert witnesses, and other inculpatory and exculpatory evidence.

Conducting Interviews

- ▶ Identify all relevant (and available) witnesses.
 - ▶ Generally begin with complainant to obtain details about the complaint.
 - ▶ Decide when to interview the respondent and witnesses.
- ▶ If possible, conduct interviews in person.
- ▶ Interview witnesses separately.

Conducting Interviews

- ▶ What should you have with you during the interview?
 - ▶ Copy of formal complaint
 - ▶ Investigation log
 - ▶ Sheet for taking notes
 - ▶ Outline of pre-prepared questions
 - ▶ Evidence you may need to reference / show to the witness
 - ▶ Copy of relevant policies or handbooks

Conducting Interviews

- ▶ Explain purpose of the interview, and your role in the investigation process.
 - ▶ Duty is to gather information.
- ▶ Do not guarantee confidentiality of information gathered during interview and explain that Title IX allows for limited disclosures of information to others involved in the formal complaint process.
- ▶ Discuss Doral's anti-retaliation policies, and requirement under Title IX that Doral will not retaliate against those participating in the formal complaint process.
- ▶ Emphasize the need for accurate and truthful information.

Conducting Interviews

- ▶ Remember your role.
 - ▶ Do not share your personal thoughts about the complaint, or what you think the outcome may be.
 - ▶ Do not agree (or disagree) with the witness. Duty is to gather information.
 - ▶ Do allow each witness to suggest other people who may have knowledge about the complaint.

Conducting Interviews

- ▶ Gather details.
 - ▶ What happened before the incident?
 - ▶ What happened during the incident?
 - ▶ What happened after the incident?
- ▶ Focus on “freeze frame” on moments to describe details.
 - ▶ What could you see? Hear?
 - ▶ How were you positioned? Where was the other person in relation to you?
 - ▶ Elicit details about tone, demeanor, body language, etc.

Conducting Interviews

- ▶ Allow witnesses to speak for themselves; don't ask "leading" questions or put words into their mouth.
- ▶ Review your notes and ask follow-up questions.
 - ▶ Focus on details in the formal complaint, and review if you have elicited all of the information the witness may have about the complaint.
 - ▶ Check for understanding and ask any clarifying questions you may have.
- ▶ Review your notes to determine if the witness may have inculpatory or exculpatory evidence related to the complaint.

Conducting Interviews

- ▶ Considerations when interviewing a respondent:
 - ▶ Emphasize that Doral has not made a determination regarding responsibility.
 - ▶ Emphasize presumption of innocence and the evidentiary standard that will be used (preponderance or clear and convincing).

Documenting Interviews

- ▶ Document the interview (questions asked, responses, etc.).
 - ▶ Note time, date, location of meeting, individuals present, etc.
 - ▶ Document facts and observations provided by the interviewee.
 - ▶ Implausible or impossible statements?
 - ▶ Inconsistencies in responses?
 - ▶ Do not make conclusions or document your opinions.
- ▶ Consider that your notes may be considered by a decision-maker or an appeal officer, as well as by a court in a legal proceeding.

After the Interview

- ▶ Update investigation log.
- ▶ Update witness list.
- ▶ Update list of evidence.
- ▶ Formulate questions to ask of other witnesses.
- ▶ Follow up on issues / questions raised during the interview.
- ▶ Is law enforcement involved? Should they be?
- ▶ Ensure physical evidence is stored and documented.

Part 7: Investigative Reports, Determinations Regarding Responsibility, and Appeals

Inspection of Evidence

- ▶ When the investigation is completed, but before the investigative report is written, the investigator must send the parties (and their advisors, if any) evidence directly related to the allegations, in electronic format or hard copy, with at least 10 days for the parties to inspect, review, and respond to the evidence.
 - ▶ Include evidence you may not rely on, but that is relevant to the claims in the formal complaint.
 - ▶ Include inculpatory and exculpatory evidence, whether obtained from a party or another source.
- ▶ Investigator must consider a party's response, if any, and begin the process of preparing an investigative report.

Investigative Report

- ▶ After the parties have had a chance to review and respond to the relevant evidence, prepare an investigative report that includes:
 - ▶ Procedural history of the formal complaint and the investigative process.
 - ▶ Summary of the allegations that could constitute sexual harassment.
 - ▶ Summary of relevant policies and the evidentiary standard (preponderance or clear and convincing).

Investigative Report

- ▶ Report must include:
 - ▶ Information about witness interviews (date of interviews, attendees, summary of interview).
 - ▶ Summary of all relevant evidence, inculpatory and exculpatory.
 - ▶ Investigation timeline.
 - ▶ Identify any irregularities in the timeline for completing the investigation.
 - ▶ Appendices with relevant physical or documentary evidence.

Investigative Report

- ▶ Investigative report does not include a conclusion or a recommendation concerning responsibility.
 - ▶ Report is to summarize the facts for the decision-maker.
 - ▶ If your report includes a conclusion or determination regarding responsibility, take it out!
- ▶ Road map for the decision-maker to reach a determination regarding responsibility.

Sending the Investigative Report

- ▶ Investigative report must be sent to the parties (and advisors, if any), in electronic format or hard copy, with at least 10 days for the parties to review and respond.
 - ▶ Incorporate relevant portions of a party's response to the final investigative report and document the rationale for any changes to the report after the parties have an opportunity to review and respond.
- ▶ Investigator sends copy of the final investigative report to the Title IX Coordinator.
 - ▶ Title IX Coordinator then assigns decision-maker.

Decision-Makers

- ▶ Role is to objectively evaluate the evidence and reach a determination regarding responsibility.
 - ▶ Did the respondent engage in conduct prohibited by Title IX as alleged in the formal complaint?
- ▶ Properly apply:
 - ▶ Presumption of innocence.
 - ▶ Burden of proof (remains on the school throughout the process).
 - ▶ Relevancy and credibility determinations.
 - ▶ Privilege / medical record protections.

Decision-Makers

- ▶ Look for consistency, accuracy, memory, credibility or lack of credibility, implausibility, unreliability, ulterior motive, etc.
 - ▶ Investigator should prepare an objective report to assist with this process.
- ▶ Consider evidence in total and make determination based on weight and credibility.

Decision-Makers

- ▶ After the investigative report has been sent to the parties, and before the decision-maker makes a determination regarding responsibility, the decision-maker must afford each party the opportunity to:
 - ▶ Submit written, relevant questions that a party wants asked of any party or witness;
 - ▶ Provide each party with the answers; and
 - ▶ Allow for additional, limited follow-up questions from each party.
- ▶ If you decide to exclude a question as not relevant, provide a written explanation as to why the question will be excluded.

Written Determinations

Decision-maker must review relevant evidence and issue a written determination regarding responsibility, which must include:

- ▶ Identification of the allegations that could constitute prohibited conduct under Title IX.
- ▶ Description of procedural steps taken from receipt of formal complaint through the determination:
 - ▶ Notices provided to parties
 - ▶ Interviews with parties and witnesses
 - ▶ Methods used to gather other evidence

Written Determinations

- ▶ Findings of fact supporting the determination.
- ▶ Application of Doral's code of conduct to the facts.
- ▶ Statement / rationale for the results as to each allegation, including a determination regarding responsibility.
- ▶ Disciplinary sanctions and remedies to implement.
- ▶ Procedures and permissible bases for either party to appeal.

Written Determinations

- ▶ Procedural anomalies to explain?
- ▶ Are all elements of the allegations accounted for?
- ▶ Are all relevant disputed facts resolved in the final analysis?
- ▶ Is there a clear connection between the charges, the investigation, the evidence, and the conclusions?
- ▶ Would an unfamiliar reader be able to connect the dots?

Written Determinations

- ▶ Determination must be sent simultaneously to both parties (and their advisors, if any), along with information on the process to appeal.
- ▶ Determination becomes final:
 - ▶ If no appeal filed, the date on which an appeal would no longer be timely.
 - ▶ If appeal filed, the date on which a written appeal decision is provided to the parties.

Implementation

- ▶ Title IX Coordinator is responsible for effectively implementing remedies provided through the determination regarding responsibility.

Reminders for Decision-Makers

- ▶ Render a sound and reasoned decision on every charge.
- ▶ Identify actual or perceived conflict of evidence.
- ▶ Determine which evidence to believe, the importance of the evidence, and conclusions to draw from the evidence.
- ▶ Determination based solely on relevant evidence.
- ▶ Do not be swayed by prejudice, sympathy, or a personal view that you may have of the claim or any party.

Reminders for Decision-Makers

- ▶ Give information provided by the parties and witnesses appropriate weight.
- ▶ Evaluate witness credibility.
 - ▶ Consider reasonableness or unreasonableness of the testimony.
 - ▶ Does a witness have an improper / ulterior motive?
 - ▶ Is there a bias?
 - ▶ Consistency, memory, accuracy?
- ▶ Rely on the appropriate evidentiary standard to guide decision-making process.

Appeals

- ▶ Doral must offer both parties an appeal from:
 - ▶ Determination regarding responsibility; or
 - ▶ Dismissal of a formal complaint or allegations in a formal complaint.
- ▶ Grounds for appeal:
 - ▶ Procedural irregularity that affected the outcome of the matter.
 - ▶ New evidence not reasonably available at the time the determination of responsibility was made and that could affect the outcome of the matter.
 - ▶ Any of the Title IX team members had a bias for or against one of the parties that affected the outcome.
 - ▶ Any other bases for appeal allowed by Doral, so long as they apply equally to both parties.

Appeals

- ▶ When appeal is filed, must notify the non-appealing party.
- ▶ Appeal officer cannot have been previously involved in the determination being appealed.
- ▶ Appeal officer must be free from bias and conflict of interest.
- ▶ Provide both parties a reasonable, equal opportunity to submit a written statement in support of or challenging the appeal.

Appeals

- ▶ For all appeals, Doral must:
 - ▶ Issue a written decision describing the result of the appeal and the rationale for the result.
 - ▶ Provide the written decision simultaneously to both parties.

Retaliation Prohibited

- ▶ Final Rule prohibits retaliation.
 - ▶ Retaliation includes actions related to a report or investigation of sexual harassment for the purpose of interfering with any right or privilege secured by Title IX.
- ▶ Complaints of retaliation may be submitted through Doral's standard procedures for reporting retaliation.
- ▶ Referring a person for code of conduct violations related to making materially false statements during a Title IX grievance process does not constitute retaliation.
 - ▶ However, the fact that a respondent is found not responsible does not automatically mean that a complainant acted in bad faith or made a materially false statement.

Recordkeeping

- ▶ Doral must maintain for a period of seven years records of:
 - ▶ Each sexual harassment investigation, including any determination regarding responsibility, disciplinary sanctions imposed on the respondent, remedies provided to the complainant.
 - ▶ Any appeal and the result therefrom.
 - ▶ Any informal resolution and the result therefrom.
 - ▶ All materials used to train Title IX Coordinators, investigators, decision-makers, and persons who facilitate an information resolution process.

Recordkeeping

- ▶ Any actions, including supportive measures, taken in response to a report or formal complaint of sexual harassment.
 - ▶ Basis for the conclusion that a response was not deliberately indifferent.
 - ▶ Document measures taken to restore or preserve equal access to the school's education program or activity.
 - ▶ If supportive measures are not provided to a complainant, document the reasons why.

Questions?